

**Ice Dragon Scoring Rubric:  
Illumination**

Page 1 of 2

QUALITY	<b>9-10</b> A Piece at this level:	<b>7-8</b> A Piece at this level:	<b>5-6</b> A Piece at this level:	<b>3-4</b> A Piece at this level:	<b>1-2</b> A Piece at this level:
<b>Documentation:</b> the extent to which the entrant provides written material that explains what they were trying to produce, the materials used, and the processes followed, as well as appropriate historical background and source(s) for the entry	States what entry is and cites location, dates & period exemplars (primary or secondary source) or if based on a style rather than an existing piece, several exemplars. Contains photocopy or picture of exemplar(s), analysis of the style (defining characteristics). Contains information on the process used to create the piece including explanation of any substitutions or changes to period practices. Lists materials used and complete bibliography.	States what entry is, cites location, date & period exemplars.(primary or secondary source) or several exemplars if a period style is used. Contains photocopy or picture of exemplar(s), information on the process used to create the piece, an explanation of any substitutions or changes to period practices, a list of materials used, and an incomplete bibliography.	States what entry is; cites location, date, and one period exemplar from a primary or secondary source; describes the process used to make the piece, contains a list of materials used, explains any substitutions, cites some sources incompletely	States what entry is; cites location and date, but contains no exemplars. Lists materials used without detailing process or substitutions made. Is poorly presented.	States any *one* item that you would normally expect to find in documentation (what entry is, materials used, etc....)
<b>Authenticity:</b> the extent to which the entry uses period materials and techniques to create an item of any specified period (may be influenced by process, materials, or aesthetics)	Uses period pigments and binders. Uses vellum. Uses real gold and period size (if appropriate to style) Depicts any people or animals as they would have been in a piece from the chosen period. Is done to size and scale of period pieces. Either contains no easily detected mistakes or deals with errors in a period manner	Uses a combination of modern and period pigments and binders, good quality paper or “spam” vellum, real gold leaf and modern size (if appropriate to style). Is done to scale of period pieces. mistakes dealt with in a mostly period manner	Uses gouache or watercolors, good quality paper, imitation gold leaf, ink or paint (if appropriate to the style). Mistakes are cleanly erased or painted over	Uses non period paints (acrylic), uses thin paper, uses yellow paint in place of gold (if used). combines portions of different exemplars - often taken out of context; is inaccurately scaled (usually too big).	Uses things other than paint for color (markers, colored pencils etc); uses thin paper (modern calligraphy parchment included); uses yellow paint in place of gold (if used); uses only a portion of an exemplar taken out of context; Scale of elements used is totally inaccurate
<b>Creativity:</b> the extent to which the artist combined original elements and substitutions with a knowledge of period styles to create a piece that did not exist in the Middle Ages	Uses period models to learn a style rather than recreate an existing piece --- Incorporates mistakes into piece --- Incorporates heraldic badges and devices in a highly complementary fashion	Uses elements from several pieces of a single style to create an original piece. Incorporates some period mistakes into piece. Incorporates heraldic badges and devices in a complementary fashion	Uses a single period model to recreate an existing piece --- Incorporates modern heraldic badges and devices in an attractive, though non-period fashion	Uses poor sources to base work on (Victorian or modern versions of medieval designs); incorporates modern heraldic badges and devices in an arbitrary and completely modern fashion	Uses inappropriate sources to base entry on (coloring books, fantasy art or motifs originating from memory); does not deviate from a printed exemplar (may have been traced)

## Ice Dragon Scoring Rubric: Illumination

Page 2 of 2

QUALITY	<b>9-10</b> A Piece at this level:	<b>7-8</b> A Piece at this level:	<b>5-6</b> A Piece at this level:	<b>3-4</b> A Piece at this level:	<b>1-2</b> A Piece at this level:
<p><b>Workmanship:</b> the extent to which the entrant uses their skill combined with knowledge of materials and techniques to produce an entry</p>	<p>Demonstrates a good use of space, maintains a consistency of paint color, coverage and texture. Has clean white work, diaper patterns, and knotwork (if appropriate to the style). Shows a commitment to painting elements (shadows, highlights, shading appropriate to the style). Has no detectable flaws in the gilding (if appropriate to the style), neat edges to painted and/or gilded areas, consistency in line width (knotwork or vine work) or repetitive elements. maintains proper size ratios of individual elements. Has no non period makings left on the page (pencil marks erased)</p>	<p>Demonstrates a good use of space; maintains a consistency of paint color, coverage and texture; exhibits clean white work, diaper patterns, or knotwork (if appropriate to the style); shows a good attempt at shading, but lacks defined highlights and shadows (muddy). Has some flaws in gilding (if used) neat edges to painted and/or gilded areas; shows consistency in line width (knotwork or vine work) or repetitive elements; maintains proper size ratios of individual elements; no non period makings left on the page</p>	<p>Shows an understanding of use of space, but few gaps or obvious fixes, paint outside the lines, unpainted spots, inconsistent paint coverage – paint too thin in some areas, obvious brush marks in others; exhibits inconsistencies in white work, diaper patterns, and knotwork (if appropriate to the style); shows an understanding of shading but placement or technique is off; mostly neat edges on painted and/or gilded areas; shows inconsistency in repetitive elements; exhibits improper size ratios of individual elements; contains some non period makings left..</p>	<p>Has paint outside of lines, unpainted spots, inconsistent coverage - paint too thin in some areas, brush marks are evident in others; makes incomplete attempt at paint shading (inconsistent in light source - not enough contrast); large areas left blank or elements crunched together to fit available space; exhibits poor consistency in line width (knotwork and vine work) or repetitive elements; exhibits improper size ratios in international bar and ivy (if used); mistakes left as is or poorly dealt with</p>	<p>Large areas left blank or elements crunched together to fit available space; inconsistent coloring (outside of lines, blank spots ... looks messy); 3 dimensional motifs painted in one shade only; ragged edges from painting over lines; uneven consistency in line width (knotwork and vine work) or repetitive elements; improper size ratios in international bar and ivy (if used); penciled layout lines left; displays poor work habits (many mistakes or marks on paper that could have been easily avoided or fixed)</p>
<p><b>Complexity:</b> the extent to which the entry was difficult to make (materials used, availability of materials, difficulty of style, number and difficulty of steps, intricate details and overall size)</p>	<p>Contains well executed human or animal figures, raised gilding, possibly tooled, if appropriate --- uses period materials properly (good technique). contains intricate design (precise repetitive elements such as diapering or knotwork) ---overall size and scale of elements is highly accurate</p>	<p>Contains human or animal figures; contains gilding ; uses period materials; contains elaborate designs; exhibits overall size and scale of elements</p>	<p>Contains simple designs, diaper patterns or knotwork patterns. Exhibits somewhat correct overall size and scale of elements</p>	<p>Is simple and cartoonish in design; Takes elements out of scale from exemplar (usually too large); exhibits little no consistency of size and shape of repeated elements</p>	<p>Extremely simple &amp; cartoonish; elements taken out of scale from exemplar (usually too large); inconsistency of size and shape of repeated elements</p>
<p><b>Aesthetics:</b> the extent to which the elements of an entry work together to create a pleasing whole while maintaining the "flavor" of a period piece (may include elements like content, size and shape of piece, proportion, style, historical accuracy, composition, color choice, how it interacts with the viewer, and overall appeal to the viewer)</p>	<p>Looks like a page from a medieval manuscript. uses colors found in period. maintains a consistency of style. elements shown in perspective appropriate to the style. Shows good balance in color and layout</p>	<p>Looks like a modern forgery of a page from a medieval manuscript; uses colors found in period; maintains a consistency of style. elements are in perspective appropriate to the style; displays good balance in color and layout</p>	<p>Looks similar to a page from a medieval manuscript; mostly uses colors found in period; maintains a consistency of style; elements not shown in the perspective appropriate to the style; exhibits good balance in either color or layout, but not both</p>	<p>Border is often even all the way around (no recto or verso); uses some period colors; combines elements from several different styles. elements painted without any consideration of perspective; unbalanced in layout or color</p>	<p>Border is often even all the way around (no recto or verso); uses non-period colors; combines elements from several different styles; unbalanced in layout and color balance; contains jarringly modern elements</p>